

MINUTES
REGULAR PLAN COMMISSION MEETING
May 27, 2021

Call to Order and Roll Call

Chairperson Mary Loch called the meeting to order at 7:01 p.m. She delivered prepared remarks about the remote proceedings of the meeting, conducted via videoconference due to the COVID-19 disaster declaration and associated public health concerns. She explained the function of the Plan Commission, and described procedures for the evening's meeting, including how public participation would be facilitated. Chairperson Loch introduced the following Village representatives participating in the meeting: Community Development Director Staci Springer, Planning Manager Kelly Purvis and Recording Secretary Barbara Dutton.

Roll call was taken. Present: Chairperson Loch and Plan Commissioners Angela Fanella, Tracy Heming-Littwin, John Mulherin and David Rodemann. Absent: Plan Commissioners Lloyd Berry, Laura Brown, Mohammed Saeed and Jamie Vondruska.

Adoption of Emergency Allowance of Remote Participation by the Plan Commission

A motion to allow remote participation in the meeting was made by Commissioner Heming-Littwin and seconded by Commissioner Fanella. The motion passed with five (5) yes votes and zero (0) no votes as follows: Commissioners Heming-Littwin, Fanella, Mulherin and Rodemann and Chairperson Loch voted "yes."

Public Comment Non-Agenda Items

There was no public comment pertaining to non-agenda items.

Approval of April 22, 2021 Plan Commission Meeting Minutes

Commissioner Mulherin moved to approve the draft minutes of the April 22, 2021 Plan Commission meeting; seconded by Commissioner Rodemann. The motion passed with five (5) yes votes and zero (0) no votes as follows: Commissioners, Mulherin, Rodemann, Fanella and Heming-Littwin, and Chairperson Loch voted "yes."

Public Hearing Concerning a Special Use Permit, Zoning Variations and an Exterior Appearance application to allow the construction of a winter sports complex which will include a paddle court facility, to be located on the property at 21W451 Hill Avenue

A motion to open the Public Hearing concerning a Special Use Permit, Zoning Variations and an Exterior Appearance application to allow the construction of a winter sports complex which will include a paddle court facility, to be located on the property at 21W451 Hill Avenue was made and seconded by Commissioners Heming-Littwin and Mulherin, respectively. The motion passed with five (5) yes votes and zero (0) no votes as follows: Commissioners Heming-Littwin, Mulherin, Fanella and Rodemann and Chairperson Loch voted "yes."

Staff Introduction

Planning Manager Purvis and Director Springer, 535 Duane Street, were sworn in. The former stated that the petitioner is requesting approval of a Special Use Permit, Zoning Variations and an Exterior Appearance application to allow the construction of a winter sports complex which will include a paddle court facility, to be located on the property at 21W451 Hill Avenue. The Special Use Permit is to allow a private recreational facility in the Conservation-Recreation District; and the Zoning Variations are to allow a 42-ft. setback where 48.7 feet is required for recreational equipment, and to allow 250 parking stalls where 1,646 parking stalls are required. The subject property, she said, is located on the south side of Hill Avenue at the Village's eastern border and is comprised of about 150 acres, some of which was annexed into the Village in 2014, while the balance remains unincorporated. The surrounding land uses are single-family residential in the Village and in the County, Prairie Path, industrial properties, ComEd right-of-way and Forest Preserve property. The unincorporated (and larger) portion of the Club's property holds an 18-hole golf course, a clubhouse, pool, a driving range and short practice facility, skeet and trap shooting range and several dining facilities. The site, noted Planning Manager Purvis, has been home to the Glen Oak Country Club for about 110 years.

Proposed, she said, is a 16,000SF, two-story winter sports facility to include four heated outdoor paddle courts, a gathering hall, a bar, and an outdoor seating area and lounges. Golf simulators that can accommodate up to 12 people at a time are planned for the lower level. The facility is expected to be open from 9:00 a.m. - 11:00 p.m. with peak usage November through March, she continued. If fully utilized there would be up to 32 players using the paddle courts (rotating as only four can be on a court at one time). The paddle courts would be primarily used in the evening hours from 5:00 p.m. to 11:00 p.m. The facility, stated Planning Manager Purvis, would be directly accessible from Hill Avenue, on which two curb cuts are proposed. The driveway would have an entry on its western access point and accommodate one-way traffic eastbound. Seven parking stalls, including an ADA-compliant one, are proposed for in front of the facility. Secondary access would be provided by a path from the existing clubhouse parking lot, which will provide overflow parking. The Zoning Code requires parking based upon gross land area, she explained, but added that the 250 parking stalls provided on the property have been adequate to serve the facilities over the years. The petitioner also requests a setback variation from the requirement of 48.7 feet to 42.54 feet. The petitioner is proposing to install 50 lilac bushes along the driveway to screen the parking spaces, and intends to plant a combination of shade trees, ornamental trees, shrubs, perennials and grasses, many of which are listed on the Village's recommended plant list in the Exterior Appearance Guidelines. Meant to be compatible in materials and design with the existing clubhouse, stated Planning Manager Purvis, the proposed facility is to feature stucco, faux slate roof shingles, teal-colored painted trim, and thin stone veneer. The petitioner proposes several exterior light fixtures including bollards for the walking path, paddle court lighting, building fixtures, and lighting to illuminate the proposed signage. Planning Manager Purvis stated that all of the proposed fixtures meet the Village's shielding requirements. She explained further that the Petitioner is proposing an average illumination level of 50fc on the courts to support Class II Competition, though the Village's lighting consultant suggests 30fc (in accordance with Illuminating Engineering Society of North America standards) for Class III play. She displayed images of paddle courts

at Maryknoll Park, which she said, averages 31fc on the courts. She outlined the requested/suggested Plan Commission action.

Commissioner Mulherin asked how perimeter mesh screening recommended by Village consultant James Benes & Associates is different than what the Petitioner proposes. Commissioner Heming-Littwin interjected that she believed the reference to be to wind screening, and asked for confirmation of the height from the ground to the top of the light fixtures vs. from the ground to the top of the screening. Planning Manager Purvis stated that the light fixtures are not as tall as the building, and displayed an illustration. Commissioner Rodemann asked if trash handling was considered and whether there were any condensers onsite/if mechanical equipment would be contained in a roof well. Planning Manager Purvis said mechanicals are proposed for the mansard roof, and that no refuse containers are planned for outside the Winter Sports Facility. Commissioner Rodemann expressed concern about disposal bins being an afterthought, as well as about lighting source shielding. Planning Manager Purvis said she thought this would be addressed. Commissioner Fanella asked for confirmation of the Maryknoll courts' light turn-off time. Planning Manager Purvis replied it has an 11:15 automatic turnoff, as required by their approving Ordinance.

Petitioner's Presentation

Sworn in for the Petitioner were Mark Christensen, 27W017 Lowden, Wheaton; Elizabeth Kivland, Chipman Design Architecture, 1350 E. Touhy Ave., Des Plaines, IL; Brett Duffy and Joe Lewis, SPACECO, 9575 W. Higgins Rd., Rosemont, IL; and Jim Cardamone, 811 Bemis Rd., Glen Ellyn, IL (from Glen Oak Country Club). Mr. Christensen stated that the new complex envisioned is a result of an assessment of club member experience realizing a preference among young member for paddle ball, and said Glen Oak is one of the few clubs in the region without a paddle complex. He cited Maryknoll as a testament to the sport's popularity. Golf simulators, he explained, would supplement paddle courts from November through March, and that the facility would also accommodate parties and showers. He stated that frontage of the complex would be off of Hill Avenue, have easy access off the Club's existing parking lot, and southeast views over the golf course. Architect Kivland said the exterior design, which she described as "straightforward," carries the aesthetic of the main clubhouse. She stated that the facility will feature an exterior fireplace, and that mechanical equipment will be in the well in the mansard roof. With trash from the small prep kitchen is to be carted to the clubhouse, she said there shouldn't be any extraneous trash receptacle. Ms. Kivland stated that the height of the chain link fence/chicken wire is approximately 12 feet above court surface, and from there, posts will be approximately 18 feet. Roof truss engineering is still underway, she added, but lights will remain lower than the building, with a 5 ft.-6 ft. difference between the lights and the top of the caging. Windscreen apparatus, she indicated, could be added.

Commissioner Questions

Commissioner Heming-Littwin asked the distance from ground grade to paddle court. Ms. Kivland stated that the height varies because of the slope of the site. She continued, explaining that 7 ft. 10 in. is the top of the court, so it's about 6 feet down to start, with a ramp up to court level. Commissioner Heming-Littwin asked if the path lighting would have auto turn off at 11 p.m. Mr. Christensen responded affirmatively, saying something similar to Maryknoll could be enabled. He agreed with the Commissioner (who, as a participant in the sport, maintained that the season begins in September) that the paddle ball

court could see year-round activity, but denoted the sport doesn't see substantial play in the summer. Pointing to a wetland pond that she thought filters into the DuPage River, Commissioner Heming-Littwin asked about plans to clear the path in the winter. Mr. Christensen stated the proposed complex is downstream from and somewhat independent of the pond. Club General Manager Cardamone reported that the Club is still under bond and working to meet Village wetlands regulations, and that no runoff issues are anticipated. Commissioner Heming-Littwin said she wondered specifically about the path. Mr. Christensen said it was on the opposite side of the crest of a hill. Commissioner Heming-Littwin inquired about an outdoor sound system. Mr. Cardamone stated that there is no intention to have one, and Mr. Christensen stated that there had been no discussion of music outside. Commissioner Heming-Littwin asked how the Club intended to enforce parking rules in front of the "hut." Mr. Cardamone replied that the Club has valet service and that staff can be deployed for "kicking people out" of spots. Since the facility is close to other parking, he didn't think there would be a need to "cheat" at parking.

Commissioner Mulherin asked about the justification for the Class II option with 50fc lighting when Class III seems more appropriate. Mr. Christensen said, while he appreciates the Consultant's input, the 50fc was opted for in light of Midwest player preference for a brighter court, and that the hope is for 50fc, or alternatively a dimmer switch to brighten the area for certain competitions. Asked for consideration, he added that brighter lighting would better accommodate any closed-circuit televising of matches, and stressed that the lighting plan is in compliance with Village requirements. Commissioner Mulherin asked what impact the difference in foot candles has on transition out (i.e., light splash away from) the facility. Mr. Christensen, who noted two homes across Hill, maintained that the 200-watt fixture option selected eliminated the need for a variance associated with a previously specified 300-watt fixture option and presents a level of splash incidental at the property line. Commissioner Rodemann surmised that the photometrics run didn't include a windscreen that might absorb some light spill, an understanding Mr. Christensen confirmed. Ms. Kivland stated that, though the model was exclusive to the light fixtures, screening and landscaping will provide shielding. Commissioner Rodemann expressed concern over observation of 300 watts getting 80 fc, saying he isn't sure about the lighting level being proposed. Mr. Christensen stated that the 200w-equivalent solution chosen achieves an average of approximately 50fc, and that a dimmer would be necessary to get 30. Noting the height proposed, Commissioner Heming-Littwin said she hasn't seen screening on lights before and isn't clear on its effectiveness. Ms. Kivland stated that the screen is an add-on piece to meet the Village's Dark Sky ordinance, and is to eliminate initial light spread. Acknowledging that an older schedule presented conveys a higher fc level, Ms. Kivland confirmed that a 200w fixture is specified.

Commissioner Rodemann recommended wind screening be incorporated into the plan. Mr. Christensen stated that screening could be put on the fencing off of Hill since "everywhere else" faces the golf course, but said it could be applied to appropriate places. Calling the northwest corner of the facility the "problem corner," Ms. Kivland indicated potential application "along Hill and probably slightly around the west corner," adding that trees are planned for here. Commissioner Rodemann expressed a desire to see screening at least on the north side.

Commissioner Heming-Littwin asked if the Club has thought about expansion. Mr. Christensen reported it had, and that the site presents some room to expand eastward. Chairperson Loch asked the distance

of the walkway; Planning Manager Purvis estimated 254 feet. Director Springer said there are three houses across the street. Commissioner Fanella suggested an 11:15 p.m. automatic light shutdown, which Mr. Cardamone deemed fair.

Public Comment

Planner Manager Purvis read the following received written comment into the record:

Kevin Stough, Land Preservation Manager, Forest Preserve District of DuPage County, 35580 Naperville Rd., Wheaton, IL 60189: Re: Public Hearing - Glen Oak Country Club, 21W451 Hill Avenue

"Dear Ms. Loch,

"The Forest Preserve District of DuPage County recently received a Notice of Public Hearing regarding Glen Oak Country Club's petition for a Special Use Permit and three Zoning Variations, to allow for the construction of a winter sports complex at the aforementioned address. We appreciate receiving timely notification of such requests that may have an impact on District property and thank you for the opportunity to comment.

District staff has reviewed the information provided and does not have any comments. Please do not hesitate to call [me] if you have any questions."

Timothy and Linda Kelly, 1023 Shady Lane, Glen Ellyn, IL 60137: *"Our concern is in regard to the proposed intensity of light, even with the understanding that recommended deflectors will be in place to help with limiting illumination to surrounding properties. We also have a concern with the noise level being reasonable until and no later than 11:00 pm. The noise level of live band music for past events has already been disturbing to residents until at least 11:00 pm and sometimes later."*

Rob Elliot, 21W171 Hill Avenue, Glen Ellyn, IL 60137: *"Dear Kelly,*

"We are the owners of the Glen Oak Park located at 1081 Hill Ave to 1119 Hill Ave in the Village of Glen Ellyn, Illinois.

"We have reviewed the plans for the Glen Oak Country Club and fully support the approval of this project.

"We have been DuPage County neighbors and now Village of Glen Ellyn for more than fifty years. The country club has always kept an attractive appearance along Hill Avenue and even on Spring. They continue to improve the area with parking on the North side of Hill Avenue and season adjusted flowers and decorations. The appearance from Hill Avenue for the new building is attractive and will add to the overall appearance.

"Thank you for the opportunity to express our approval."

Commissioner Heming-Littwin moved to close the Public Hearing; seconded by Commissioner Mulherin, the motion carried with five (5) yes votes and zero (0) no votes as follows: Commissioners Heming-Littwin, Mulherin, Fanella, Rodemann and Chairperson Loch voted "yes."

Commissioner Discussion

Believing the photometrics process to be “pretty accurate,” Commissioner Rodemann said that if the model shows the light level to be acceptable at the property line, he thinks the ability to have a higher lighting level on the courts would probably make sense. Suggesting that the effectiveness of shields depends on how lights are positioned, he said he would like the Club to be in a position to make adjustments if neighbors see light sources, adding that a windscreen on the north side is an easy thing to ask for. Reporting that she’d recently driven through the area, which she pronounced “dark,” Commissioner Heming-Littwin expressed concern about lighting, saying it is “going to be a big change.” She recommended going with the lower fc, as based on her experience 30 is more than bright enough, and suggested a restriction prohibiting outdoor music. Though she expressed concern about screen placement giving an advantage to certain courts during play, Commissioner Heming-Littwin agreed that the north side should be screened, which, she said, would with some of the lighting, but offered a reminder that deciduous trees will be barren during the season of play. She is in favor of the Special Use and variation request. Stating he was in agreement with Commissioner Rodemann, Commissioner Mulherin expressed a degree of confidence in the validity of the photometrics performed relative to the area, which he observed to be dark and sparse. He opined that the Club is well managed and said he doesn’t expect its “good neighbor relationship” to change with this facility. He said he approves of the setback variation, as well as the variation pertaining to parking, as it will avoid adding impervious surface to the site. He stated he has no concerns about the exterior appearance proposed for the facility, which he views as a positive development, and said that 50 fc is appropriate. Commissioner Fanella said she agrees with Commissioner Mulherin, and that she appreciates that the Petitioner is looking to improve the Club. She said the zoning variations seem reasonable, and the lighting is “not going to be excessively irritable to the neighbors;” hence, she is in favor of the project. Chairperson Loch said she echoes Commissioners Mulherin, Fanella and Rodemann, and called the plan “respectable.” Her only concern is lighting, so she recommended screening on the court fencing, especially on the north side.

Commissioner Heming-Littwin, seconded by Commissioner Mulherin moved for the following:

After conducting a public hearing and deliberating on the requests of the petitioner, Jim Cardamone on behalf of the Glen Oak Country Club, for approval of a Special Use Permit, Zoning Variations, and Exterior Appearance, to allow the construction of a winter sports complex at 21W451 Hill Avenue in the CR Zoning District, the Plan Commission hereby recommends approval based on the findings of fact, as discussed or amended at the Plan Commission public hearing on May 27, 2021, which are hereby incorporated into the Motion by reference as though fully set forth herein, and a copy of which will be attached to the minutes of this meeting and kept on file as part of the permanent records of the Village. The Plan Commission makes this recommendation of approval with the following conditions:

1. That the project be constructed in substantial conformance with the plans and testimony presented at the Plan Commission public hearing and before the Village Board of Trustees;
2. That an updated photometric plan be done to match the light fixture cut sheet for the paddle tennis courts;

3. That the remaining comments related to the lighting and photometrics be addressed to the satisfaction of the Village's lighting consultant;
4. That the lights be set to turn off automatically at 11:15 p.m.;
5. That no outside music be played;
6. That there is screening on the north side of the courts;
7. That it is the obligation of the property owner to install, maintain and replace all landscape materials in accordance with the approved landscape plan on a continuing basis; and
8. That should any rooftop mechanical units be visible from the public right-of-way or adjacent properties following construction, such equipment shall be appropriately screened from view. Screening material shall be submitted to the Community Development Department for review and approval prior to installation.

The motion passed with five (5) yes votes and zero (0) no votes as follows: Commissioners Heming-Littwin, Mulherin, Fanella and Rodemann, and Chairperson Loch voted "yes." Planning Manager Purvis said the item is scheduled to appear before the Village Board on June 28th. Mr. Cardamone said the hope is for paddle play to begin by February 2022.

Trustee's Report

None.

Staff Report

Planning Manager Purvis announced that the first Plan Commission meeting scheduled for June is cancelled, but said that there could be business for the second scheduled meeting. She reported that an offer was extended to a planner candidate to assist her. Commissioner Fanella asked if there are plans to reconvene in-person meetings. Development Director Springer stated that there is no answer yet, but reported that the Board is transitioning into in-person meetings. She added that hybrid meetings might be possible, but without IT staff present could only offer audio to remote attendees.

Chairman's Report

Chairperson Loch announced that, in light of perceived Village leadership preferences for board composition and her desire to exit gracefully, the evening's meeting was her last as Chair and as a member of the Plan Commission. She praised Staff, complimented her fellow Commissioners on their work, and expressed appreciation for neighbor participation in meetings. Commissioner Mulherin called Ms. Loch's service and Staff members "phenomenal," and expressed appreciation for the work and diligence of the Commissioners and for the public's input. He said he's willing to stay on through June and, if necessary, a little longer, but believes his term is short.

Other Business

Commissioner Heming-Littwin delivered this statement: *"As Chaucer said, 'All good things must come to an end.'*

“This will be my last Plan Commission meeting, as all things that are important in Glen Ellyn I have heard through the town rumor mill that I will not be serving another term as the new leadership is clear they want commission members who will move the village in a different direction.

“But prior to leaving I wanted to take a moment to reflect on my time here on the Commission. It’s been over 9 years that I have had the pleasure of serving my home town with all of you and those who came before you.

“I would like to thank you, Mary, for your wisdom, guidance and friendship through your tenure here, which was from most of my tenure here.

“Staci and Kelly and the past Community Development members, it has been a pleasure working with the best in the business, truly. You guys are always responsive to crazy requests, always willing to provide more clarification – and you know I always ask for that – so that I was always prepared for the meeting. Thank you and good luck. I hope you’re able to achieve everything you want in your career either in Glen Ellyn or outside of Glen Ellyn, if you choose.

“I wish Trustee Enright, Trustee Pryde and Trustee Clark, who I started underneath, were here so I could thank them in person for support and guidance. When I first got on this Commission I had really no idea what I was getting into, and they were all real helpful to me, and they were always outstanding. And as we know, our liaisons to the Board have a lot to deal with; we’re not the easiest Commission to have to liaison back to the Board, and I always thought that they always did a great job for us.

“And to the rest of you, there is so much I can say but I’m pretty sure I’m between you and ending the meeting.

“You each have taught me about many things. In my humble opinion, I believe we have been an outstanding group willing to ask insightful questions, bring up valid concerns, have differing of opinion and ultimately working collaboratively to recommend what we believed was in the best interest of Glen Ellyn. I can honestly say it has been an honor to be part of a group of people who listen, can disagree with without fear of backlash, and have done so in a mature and cooperative manner. It has not always been easy, as we know, but we have prevailed. I miss the fact that we have not been able to see each other in person and have social times due to the pandemic and hope sometime soon we can all meet up and have a cocktail to celebrate all we have done – especially in the last three years. (And I promise, the first round is on me.)

“I consider you all friends and hope our paths will continue to cross in the future.

“My final commitment to all of you is that I will continue to be active in whatever happens in Glen Ellyn as I believe we tend to have more of a vocal minority when it comes to things brought in front of this commission and the Village Board. I also promise that when I do come and speak in front of you in the future will always be respectful and stay within my three-minute timeframe.

“Always remember that Glen Ellyn is not their town, my town, his town... it is OUR town and all decisions should be made for the collective good of the Village and not a predetermined agenda.

“Thank you again for allowing me to serve. Good luck to all of you; I hope there are still great things ahead.”

Adjournment

Chairperson Loch adjourned the meeting at 8:58 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Barbara Dutton-Thomas

Recording Secretary